



## **Dimension Effect of Tangibles, Reliability, Responsiveness, Assurance, Empathy, Leadership towards Employee Satisfaction (A University in Bali)**



**Luh Kadek Budi Martini<sup>a</sup>**  
**Ida Bagus Raka Suardana<sup>b</sup>**  
**I Nengah Dasi Astawa<sup>c</sup>**

---

### **Article history:**

**Received:** 10 October 2017

**Revised:** 5 March 2018

**Approved:** 15 March 2018

**Published:** 20 March 2018

---

### **Keywords:**

*Internal Customer;*

*Internal Marketing;*

*Customer Satisfaction;*

---

### **Abstract**

The present research was intended for analyzing dimension effect of tangibles, reliability, responsiveness, assurance, empathy, and leadership towards employee satisfaction in the University. The objective research was the head office of Public University in Bali. It was a limited population of the civil servants whose minimal working time was one year. The number of samples in the present research was 185. The sampling technique used was stratified proportional random sampling. Data analysis was conducted by using structural equation model supported with AMOS 20.0. The results of data analysis were obtained that only dimension of empathy mastering a significant effect on satisfaction for an internal customer in the University in Bali.

2395-7492© Copyright 2018. The Author.

This is an open-access article under the CC BY-SA license

(<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>)

All rights reserved.

---

### **Author correspondence:**

Luh Kadek Budi Martini,

Faculty of Economics, Mahasaraswati University

Email address: [jrseruni@gmail.com](mailto:jrseruni@gmail.com)

---

### **1. Introduction**

Nowadays, it can not be denied in the era of globalization that the organization's ability in doing the competition becomes very important to survive, including the public bureaucracy. Likewise, the government organizations are no exception to educational institutions that support the formation of human beings who have competitiveness in realizing what is mandated is inseparable to the quality of human resources performance in it (Goetsch, 2002).

Unlike a University, its main duty is to organize academic and/or professional education programs in certain disciplines of science, technology and/or art. In order to be able to realize what the duties and responsibilities depend on the organization's ability to optimize the role and performance of each resource in it included the employee (non-academic staff) as the supporting element (De Jagger & Du Plooy, 2006). An internal customer in the organization should get a proportional attention, due to the impact of non-academic employee satisfaction is the service quality for the organization's external customers (Lee & Hwan, 2005). The study is intended to analyze

---

<sup>a</sup> Faculty of Economics, Mahasaraswati University Denpasar-Indonesia

<sup>b</sup> Faculty of Economics & Business (FEB) Undiknas University, Denpasar-Indonesia

<sup>c</sup> Faculty of Economics & Business (FEB) Undiknas University, Denpasar-Indonesia

the dimension effect of tangibles, reliability, responsiveness, assurance, empathy and leadership role to the employee's satisfaction at a university in Bali.

## 2. Research Methods

The research is conducted in one of a University located in Bali. The present study estimated parameters amounted 37 whereas, each parameter performed five observations. Therefore, the sample is taken 185. The sampling is conducted by using the technique *Stratified Proportional Random Sampling*. Data collection is used included questionnaires, documentation, and interview techniques. Data analysis is performed using *Structural Equation Model (SEM)* supported by *AMOS 20.0* program.

### Literature review

The American Society for Quality Control stated that quality is the whole of characteristic and good or service that affects its ability to satisfy both expressed and implied needs (Kotler, 2014). Goetsch (2002) stated that quality is a dynamic condition related to products, services, human, processes, and environments that meet or exceed expectations. Wyckoff (in Tjiptono, 2005) argued that a service quality is the excellence expected level and control over its advantages to meet customer desires. There are several approaches that can be used to analyze the services quality. According to Edvardson (2005), the existing models can be grouped into three main groups *i.e.*, *customer-perceived quality*, *the processes in the creation of the service*, and *the whole service (system models)*. Parasuraman et al. (2012) are forming a service model that the highlights key conditions in providing a high service quality (Kotler: 2012).

Tjiptono & Diana (2003: 75) suggested that from ten dimensions to assess the quality of services can be summarized into five main dimensions, *i.e.*, tangibles, reliability, responsiveness, assurance, empathy. Kotler (2012) stated that the quality of service should start from the consumer wants and needs and ends on perceptions. Zeithaml, et al (1990: 70) argued that the quality of service is the suitability of service and consumer expectations. Krishnamurthy et al. (2010) express customer satisfaction as the overall attitude towards a good or service after the acquisition and use. Whereas, Rangkuti (2002: 30) stated that customer satisfaction is a response to the discrepancy between the level of previous interest and actual performance perceived after usage.

Danin (2004: 55) proposed that a leadership as "any action is taken by individuals or other groups incorporated in particular a certain place to achieve predetermined goals". Martoyo (2000: 276) stated a leadership, unlike an overall society activities effect, want to work together for achieving a common goal. Senge (in Widodo, 2006) stated that the new leadership role is covering three points *e.g.*, *designer*, *teacher*, *steward*. Nanus (2001) conveyed four effective roles *e.g.*, *a certain direction*, *agent of spokesman change*, *trainer*. According to Irawan (2008) and Sulieman (2013) without any leadership is very unlikely will result in sustainable customer satisfaction. Therefore, the leadership role becomes very decisive to realize customer satisfaction.

## 3. Results and Analysis

### Results

The test on 37 variables from the distributed questionnaires are obtained as the dimensions of tangibles, reliability, responsiveness, assurance, and leadership roles are not significantly affect internal customer satisfaction. This is evidenced by the analysis results  $P > 0.05$  whereas, the value of  $Cr < 1.96$ . The only one dimension that significantly affects internal customer satisfaction is empathy dimension due to the analysis result after modification  $P < 0.05$  and its  $Cr > 1.96$ .

### Analysis

Based on the analysis results that have been conducted, an *empathy* variable has a significant effect on internal customer satisfaction. It can be seen from the calculation of P-value owned is lower than 0.05 and Cr value is higher than 1.96. Whereas, the variable of *tangibles*, *responsiveness*, *reliability*, *assurance* and *leadership* role have no significant effect on internal customer satisfaction due to the result of data analysis conducted P value is higher than 0,05 and Cr value less than 1,96. Triyono (2005) was conducted a research on Internal Customer Perception on Quality of Service PT. Waskita Karya Wilayah VIII. Although the research object, the technique of data analysis, and the number of variables analyzed is as well as different but, get the same result that *empathy dimension* is also one that perceived to be the determinant of internal customer satisfaction. The resulting similarity is very reasonable due to an internal customer is surely the management attention unlike attention to problems faced by an employee either officially or personally be something that is expected of their subordinates. The attention given

will have a big effect on their passion. It is shown that management's attention to employees is something to look forward to and will be very useful to foster their morale.

The differences in the results are obtained by [Lestari \(2006\)](#) wherein, only *reliability* that affects customer satisfaction is likely due to different research objects and customer expectations are different. The research is conducted by [Lestari \(2006\)](#) on Telkom Flexi Kakandatel Bali is very realistic. If the responsiveness becomes a satisfaction determinant due to a customer of telecommunication product, the speed in giving responses to every complaint submitted by consumers and the determinant factor of the customer satisfaction. Whereas, an *empathy* or attention is not a priority for them due to the company's *responsiveness* to the problems faced by consumers is the real concern they need.

If the results of the present study are related to the theory proposed by marketing theorists then it can be submitted that the results do not fully support the theory of satisfaction determinants. [Irawan \(2008\)](#) through his theory, 10 principles of the customer satisfaction support the theory proposed by [Parasuraman et al \(2008\)](#). Wherein, the dimension of *tangibles*, *reliability*, *responsiveness*, *assurance*, and *empathy* become determinant for the customer satisfaction but according to [Irawan \(2008\)](#), *leadership* as well as become determinant to the customer satisfaction. However, regarding tangibles dimensions has been expressed by [Irawan \(2008\)](#) will be more perceived effect by new customers. Whereas, the old customers who have been familiar with the physical form experienced. It will not affect the satisfaction.

In the present research, the empathy dimension showed a significant effect on satisfaction. It is supported the view suggested by [Irawan \(2008\)](#) stated that the empathy dimensions will be considered most important. If their basic needs have been met. It is as well as in accordance with the theory of development needs presented by [Maslow \(2010\)](#). At a higher level, human needs are no longer tied to the primary things. Therefore, it is very reasonable that in this study *empathy* shows the most influential dimension. The reason is due to the respondents all is civil servants and their working lives are mostly over 10 years of basic needs, the need for security, social needs can be fulfilled. Thus, the most their expected is a higher level a need is an *empathy* or attention from management unlike a support morale in accomplishing tasks and on personal matters, and in the later stages needed by them is self-actualization. The theories conveyed by several experts including [Irawan \(2008\)](#) that the *reliability* of the institution's ability to provide services in accordance with the promised to be the determinant of the customer satisfaction. In this study, the results are different due to the *reliability* does not significantly affect a satisfaction as an internal customer. The *responsiveness* dimension that involves *e.g.*, speed, accuracy, and accuracy of service delivery that theoretically becomes the satisfaction determinant in the research is also not proven. It is shown from the results of data processing dimensions appear not to have a significant effect on satisfaction.

Related to the *assurances* dimension, the result of the present study is as well as not in accordance with an existing theory. Wherein, the *assurance* dimension does not have a significant effect on employee satisfaction as an internal customer. An indicator of trust in performing tasks, rewards, and punishments work well, security guarantees in carrying out duties, polite, and friendly treatment by management. As well as a security guarantee in expressing opinions is valued unlike an institution should provide to them without must be asked and haunted by fear for the purpose of increasing employee motivation. It will affect the high performance of the institution.

The theory that is expressed the role of *leadership* to be a determinant of the customer satisfaction is also not in accordance with the results of the study due to the result of *leadership* role has no significant effect on the customer satisfaction. It could be due to the college leadership has not long been a leader. Therefore, the role that must be conducted can not be felt by employees. Another effect can be due based on experience. They have not had time to feel the leadership way has been hastily exhausted the tenure of leadership. Therefore, it makes them difficult to assess.

#### 4. Conclusion

Based on the analysis, it can be concluded that the dimensions of *tangibles*, *reliability*, *responsiveness*, *assurance* and *leadership* have no significant effect on employee satisfaction. It can be illustrated from the analysis, wherein the dimension is value of  $P > 0.05$  and value of  $Cr < 1.96$ . In continuously value of *tangibles* ( $P$ ):  $0.012 < 0.05$  and ( $Cr$ ):  $2.503 > 1.96$ , *reliability* ( $P$ ):  $0.768 > 0.05$  and value ( $Cr$ ):  $0.295 < 1.96$ , *responsiveness* ( $P$ ):  $0.890 > 0.05$  and ( $Cr$ ):  $0.138 < 1.96$ , *assurance* ( $P$ ):  $0.865 > 0.05$  and value ( $Cr$ ):  $-0.169 < 1.96$ , *leadership* ( $P$ ):  $0.811 > 0.05$  and value ( $CR$ ):  $-0.239 < 1.96$ . Thus, the dimensions are not a determinant of employee satisfaction, only *empathy dimension* have a significant effect on employee satisfaction

#### Acknowledgments

Our deep and sincere gratitude were presented to God for having granted us the ability and the opportunity to complete this paper. We would also like to thank our friends for their support, their patience, their contribution, and their valuable input, therefore, this article could be completed. We would also thank I Wayan Suryasa ([Scopus ID: 57200211897](#)) as an advisor as well as editor in chief of IJCU, IJMRA, SKIREC, Euro Asia as well as ScienceScholar who has reviewed and approved this study to be published.

**References**

- De Jager, J. W., & Du Plooy, A. T. (2006). Student's expectations of service quality in tertiary education: A comparison between prospective and current students. *Acta Commercii*, 6(1), 10-19. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Edvardsson, B. (2005). Service quality: beyond cognitive assessment. *Managing Service Quality: An International Journal*, 15(2), 127-131. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Ferdinand, A. (2002). Structural equation modeling dalam penelitian manajemen. Semarang: Badan Penerbit Universitas Diponegoro. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Goetsch, D. L., & Davis, S. (2006). *Quality management: Introduction to total quality management for production, processing, and services*. Prentice Hall. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Irawan, H. (10). Prinsip kepuasan pelanggan. Jakarta: PT. Elex Media Komputindo. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Krishnamurthy, R., SivaKumar, M. A. K., & Sellamuthu, P. (2010). Influence of service quality on customer satisfaction: Application of SERVQUAL model. *International Journal of Business and Management*, 5(4), 117. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Prentice, W., & Arnheim, D. (2013). *Principles of athletic training: A competency-based approach*. McGraw-Hill Higher Education. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Kotler, P., & Armstrong, G. (2012). Principle of Marketing (ed.). New Jersey. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Lee, M. C., & Hwan, S. (2005). Relationships among service quality, customer satisfaction and profitability in the Taiwanese banking industry. *International journal of management*, 22(4), 635. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Nanus, B., & Ruma, F. (2001). Kepemimpinan Visioner. Jakarta: Prenhallindo, Terjemahan. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Lestari. (2006). Analisis Kualitas Pelayanan Dan Kepuasan Pelanggan Telkom Flexi Kakandatel Bali, Tesis. Magister Manajemen, Program Pascasarjana Universitas Pendidikan Nasional Denpasar. [View in \(Google\)](#)
- Rangkuti, F. (2015). *Riset pemasaran*. Gramedia Pustaka Utama. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Sulيمان, A. (2013). Basic dimensions of the (SERVQUAL model) and its impact on the level of customer satisfaction: an empirical study of the housing bank in Karak, Jordan. *European Scientific Journal, ESJ*, 9(1). [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Surtha. (2003). Analisis Kinerja Pelayanan dan Tingkat Kepentingan Mahasiswa Terhadap Pelayanan Pendidikan di Universitas Hindu Indonesia. Denpasar, Jurnal Manajemen dan Bisnis, Edisi Agustus, Vol.1., Program Pascasarjana Universitas Pendidikan Nasional, Denpasar. [View in \(Google\)](#)
- Triyono, Didi. (2005). Analisis Persepsi Pelanggan Internal Terhadap Kualitas Pelayanan, PT. Waskita Karya Wilayah VIII, Tesis. Magister Manajemen, Program Pascasarjana Universitas Pendidikan Nasional Denpasar. [View in \(Google\)](#)
- Tjiptono, F. (1997). Prinsip-prinsip total quality service. Yogyakarta: Penerbit Andi. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Tjiptono, F. (2005). Pemasaran jasa. Malang: Bayumedia Publishing, 104. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Tjiptono, F. (2000). Manajemen Jasa Penerbit Andi: Yogyakarta. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Widodo, Joko. (2006). Membangun Learning Organization Sebagai Piranti Menemukan Jati Diri Pemimpin, Bahan Ajar Diklatpim II, Jawa Timur. [View in \(Google\)](#)
- Zeithaml, V. A., Parasuraman, A., & Berry, L. L. (1990). *Delivering quality service: Balancing customer perceptions and expectations*. Simon and Schuster. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Sutapa, I. K., Sutapa, I. N., & Susila, I. N. D. (2017). Implementation of Active Rest in Participatory Ergonomics Decrease Workload and Women Musculoskeletal Complaints of Parking in Mall Ramayana Denpasar. *International Journal of Life Sciences (IJLS)*, 1(2), 48-54. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Basak, A., & Khanna, K. (2017). A Study on the Selection Criteria of Different Hotels of Delhi NCR in Accordance to the HR Policies and Market Trends. *International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities (IJSSH)*, 1(1), 27-38. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)
- Omer, A. M. (2017). Sustainable Development and Environmentally Friendly Energy Systems. *International Journal of Physical Sciences and Engineering (IJPSE)*, 1(1), 1-39. [View in \(Google Scholar\)](#)



### Biography of Authors

	<p>Dr. Luh Kadek Budi Martini, SE., MM., was born in Kusamba Klungkung, March 22<sup>nd</sup>, 1975. She graduated her bachelor degree at Faculty of Economics, Undiknas Denpasar in 1987. She finished her master degree at Magister of Management Program (MM), Airlangga University in 2000. She completed her doctoral degree at Udayana University in 2017. Since 2005, she is a lecturer Faculty of Economics, Mahasaraswati University (Unmas) Denpasar. She is as well as diligent to conduct on management research, individually and groups. She is an ethic &amp; personality development instructor/trainer, communication skills, service excellent, and public speaking skills.</p> <p>Email address: <a href="mailto:jrseruni@gmail.com">jrseruni@gmail.com</a></p>
	<p>Prof. Dr. Ida Bagus Raka Suardana, SE. MM. was born in Mataram, on February 1<sup>st</sup>, 1964. He is Hindus. He is a professor at Faculty of Economics &amp; Business (FEB), University of Education National (Undiknas) Denpasar, Indonesia since on December 1<sup>st</sup>, 2006. He is as well as the Head of Team of Lecturer Work Validation, Kopertis VIII. He lives in Jl. Palapa IV/E.10 Denpasar – Bali, Ph. 0361-721092 / 081 238 70633. He graduated his bachelor degree from Faculty of Economics, Undiknas Denpasar in 1988. She finished his master degree in Agribusiness Program, IPB Bogor in 1994. He completed her Ph.D. degree in Postgraduate Program of Economics Studies Program, Universitas of Airlangga (UNAIR) Surabaya.</p> <p>Email address: <a href="mailto:ajikraka@yahoo.com">ajikraka@yahoo.com</a></p>
	<p>Prof. Dr. I Nengah Dasi Astawa was born in Bading Kayu Jembrana, February 9<sup>th</sup>, 1960. Since 1987, he is a lecturer at Faculty of Economics &amp; Business (FEB) Undiknas Denpasar. He graduated his bachelor degree at Faculty of Economics, University of Atma Jaya Yogyakarta. He completed his master and doctoral degree at Udayana University. He was a professor of management science in 2008. He actively teaches on many campuses as well as published the paper in management science and social sciences field studies. He has been authored many books and scientific articles that have been published in national and international journals.</p> <p>Email address: <a href="mailto:dasiastawa_nengah@yahoo.co.id">dasiastawa_nengah@yahoo.co.id</a></p>